

THE DEVELOPMENT OF HALAL TOURISM THROUGH INNOVATION IN INDONESIA

Wisber Wiryanto¹, Djoko Walujo², Asmadi Adnan³, Gustaria Hutapea⁴, Mu'man Nuryana⁵

¹⁻⁵Research Center for Public Policy, National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN)
Jl. Jenderal Gatot Soebroto Kav.10, Jakarta, 12710, Indonesia
wisb001@brin.go.id

ABSTRACT

Halal tourism is a leading sector of economic income for development if managed properly through innovation. Therefore, it is considered necessary to conduct research on how the application of halal tourism innovations in Indonesia. This paper addresses a research question: What are the developments in halal tourism through innovation in planning, implementation, and evaluation? This study aims to identify the planning, implementation, and evaluation of such halal tourism innovations in Indonesia after the Fatwa of the Council of Indonesian Ulama Number 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Tourism Based on Sharia Principles. The research uses library research involving online methods for collecting secondary data. Qualitative descriptive methods and policy analysis techniques are used to analyze the planning, implementation, and evaluation of the development of halal tourism through innovation in Indonesia. The results show that innovations in halal tourism policies remained minimal. Therefore, the government must foster innovation for the development of halal tourism in Indonesia.

Keywords: Halal Tourism, Innovation, Islamic Economics, Fatwa, Regional Government.

INTRODUCTION

Tourism has attracted worldwide attention. Several world institutions manage tourism, namely the United Nations-World Tourism Organization. On the other hand, there is an Islamic economic phenomenon that is developing very rapidly in the world today, not only in Islamic countries but also in Western countries with generally non-Muslim populations. These phenomena are Sharia banking, Muslim fashion, halal food (Hafidhuddin in Abadi 2016), and halal tourism. Then, halal tourism developed into a theme in Islamic economics discourse in various universities. Halal tourism has become an object of discussion for researchers in international discourse; and there is also an international institution that routinely carries out surveys every year from more than a hundred countries regarding the development of halal tourism, namely The Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI 2021).

Halal tourism as part of the Islamic economy is a growing, developing, and dynamic market segment (Papastathopoulos, Kaminakis, and Mertzanis 2020). Therefore, the halal tourism industry is being developed in various countries to increase state income through halal tourism policies. This halal tourism policy is an alternative for increasing a country's income through diversifying the tourism industry in non-Muslim majority countries (Marlinda, Cipto, Al-Fadhat, and Jubba 2021). The development of halal tourism can expand market segmentation, especially tourists from Muslim-majority countries (Yağmur and Aksu 2020). Therefore, stakeholders like public policymakers and hotel managers need to formulate an innovation for the halal tourism concept based on destination image, tourist satisfaction, and behavioral intentions.

In various countries, their respective governments are starting to focus on developing the halal tourism sector to increase economic income. Therefore, this superior sector must be managed well through specific policies by drafting regional regulations regarding halal

tourism. This regional regulation on halal tourism regulates the development, management, and operation of the tourism industry based on Islamic principles. This is because the number of Muslim tourists has increased significantly (Sofyan in Abadi 2016). There are 20% of the world's population follow the Islamic religion, and most of this population has the potential to be Muslim tourists who will fund this new business model. Therefore, the government must encourage halal tourism policies and innovations. Researchers from various countries are starting to focus on halal tourism studies. They analyze the problems that arise and the relationship between halal tourism development and its determining factors.

Based on this introduction it is necessary to research. This research aims to find out the development of halal tourism through innovations in Indonesia, according to planning, implementation, and evaluation after this fatwa as already mentioned. The research questions or research problems, are as follows: (1) What are the development of halal tourism through innovations in Indonesia at the planning stage? (2) What are the development of halal tourism through innovations at the implementation stage? and (3) What are the development of halal tourism through innovations at the evaluation stage?

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Indonesian Government has issued Government Regulation Number 38 of 2017 on Regional Innovation. This regulation is a policy instrument for local governments. In other words, the Indonesian Government has established an innovation policy for local governments to improve public services (Wiryanto 2020a, 201-215). Thus, government regulation has driven the development of halal tourism innovation. Therefore, both province and regency/city governments must start implementing regional innovations which include management innovations; public service innovation; and local government innovation related to its authority. In connection with the authority of regional governments in the tourism sector, the development of halal tourism in the regions requires innovations aimed at achieving public service targets and improving performance. In developing halal tourism as a leading sector for increasing economic income for development. So, halal tourism must be managed well through innovation. Therefore, local governments can improve public services through innovation. For example, regional governments carry out halal tourism innovations.

Halal tourism innovation is a new concept built based on Sharia principles to serve Muslim tourists. This is in line with innovation in the field of mu'amalah. This is the realization of Islamic teachings in social relations and creative creation. Innovation comes with new things and brings several benefits to society (Utomo 2017). Recently, examples of innovations are Sharia banks, Sharia hotels, and halal tourism. The government must also innovate in developing human resource competencies. As a reason, halal tourism development must be supported by competent human resources both in the Ministry of Tourism and in regional governments which include both provinces and regencies/cities. They have the right to develop managerial, technical, and socio-cultural competencies through education and training of at least 20 hours per year to improve performance (Wiryanto 2017).

Apart from reviewing processes and analysis approaches, this study reviews the current tourism research. Some literature review reveals, as follows: (1) innovation in tourism has an impact on information and communication technology; innovation activity in tourism provides evidence of the rapid evolution of the industry and its substantial impact on information and communication technology (Aldebert, Dang, and Longhi 2011); (2) For public services in Indonesia, a local government must reproduce alternative innovations according to local conditions to solve problems and use them as input for public services to function in the era of the new normal (Wiryanto 2020b). The pandemic affected government sector activities around the world, hampering tourism sector activities and public services. Studies have investigated the effects of the pandemic, including (a)

findings indicating that citizens perceived low-performance levels for public institutions during the pandemic (Kayaci 2022, 185-205); (b) public policies and citizen roles were created to tackle the challenges associated with the pandemic (Melugbo and Onwuka 2020, 279-297); and (c) the pandemic impacted changing work patterns around the world.

Furthermore, (3) research on tourism innovation explains hybrid top-down and bottom-up collaborations and focuses on the following issues: implementation processes, emerging innovation types, and outcomes and barriers (Rodriguez, Williams, and Hall 2014, 76-93); and (4) research on halal tourism explains the following aspects of this type of tourism: (a) halal tourism is rooted within Islamic Sharia as every Muslim is required to travel for several purposes, such as the Hajj and Umrah (El-Gohary 2016, 124-130); religious tourism includes ziarah qubur because visiting graves seems to be a trend for the community (Lutfiyah 2017, 6); (b) many countries are set to capture the Muslim tourist market by providing facilities and products that cater to their needs (Samori, Salleh, and Khalid 2016, 131-136); and (c) halal tourism can be applied by governments and promoted by many countries, including Indonesia. Therefore, halal tourism branding is not relevant for all tourist destinations (Slamet, Abdullah, and Laila 2022). This is contrary to previous research and determining the levels of acceptance or rejection of halal tourism in Indonesia is an urgent need. Thus, a literature review shows that studies have investigated the development of halal tourism through innovation rarely. Therefore, we arranged a theoretical framework model for the Development of Halal Tourism through Innovation in Indonesia at the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages.

The theoretical framework model for the development of halal tourism reflects some factors (variables), namely: halal tourism policies according to DSN-MUI Fatwa No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 on Guidelines for tourism implementation based on Sharia principles (independent variable); and development of halal tourism through innovation as regional innovation (independent variable). Innovation factors (independent variables) influence the development of halal tourism (dependent variable) in Indonesia through formulation, implementation, and evaluation stages.

METHODS

This study used a descriptive qualitative method. The qualitative descriptive method (Danim 2000) to explore, find problems at the planning, implementation, and evaluation (Mustopadidjaja 1993). The data collection technique was carried out by collecting secondary data sources through library research. This data source is also obtained online. The results of the data collection were processed and analyzed using content analysis techniques. In other words, there is a process gradually from generic tourism to halal tourism that quantitatively is still small. Analysis at each stage to determine the forms of innovation that exist at each stage. In other words, this analysis was carried out to answer research questions based on the formulation of this research problem. Next, a discussion was carried out on the research results by making a comparison between the results of this research and the results of previous research. In other words, the discussions carried out included data analysis carried out through a philosophical approach, characterized by selective thinking by carrying out argumentation and synthetic analysis. The results of the discussions that have been carried out are used to draw conclusions and recommendations regarding the development of halal tourism through innovation in Indonesia.

The population of this study includes all local governments in Indonesia which are divided into provinces and districts/cities. Based on this population, samples were taken using sampling techniques based on population characteristics to obtain a representative sample size. (Sugiyono 2003). This research uses the purposive sampling technique; and the snowball sampling technique by taking from few to many samples so that a representative sample size is achieved. The characteristics used are regions that already

have regional regulations regarding halal tourism. Based on the sampling technique, eight regional governments were obtained which were used as data sources for this research, namely West Nusa Tenggara Province; West Sumatra Province; Siak Regency; Aceh Jaya Regency; Muara Enim Regency; Konawe Islands Regency; Bandung district; and Banjarmasin City.

This research presents the results of data collection according to the research area used as the research sample. The results of data collection after processing are then presented in table form. To make it easier to understand the data presented in tabular form explain the form of a description that describes the trend of the data. After the data is presented in a table and explained, the data is discussed using content analysis and compared with the results of previous research and the development of halal tourism. In this way, the conditions for halal tourism development can be known through regional policies and innovations. Furthermore, based on the conditions of halal tourism development in the regions, research conclusions and recommendations can be drawn for the development of halal tourism through innovation in Indonesia in the future.

RESULTS

This study answers its research questions and draws conclusions and recommendations regarding the development of halal tourism policies and innovation in Indonesia. Results and discussion arranged to answer the questions, what are the development of halal tourism through innovation in Indonesia? These results and discussions are divided into three parts: (1) The Planning of Halal Tourism Innovations; (2) The Implementation of Halal Tourism Innovations; (2) Innovation implementation; and (3) The Evaluation of Halal Tourism Innovations, as follows.

The Planning of Halal Tourism Innovations

What are halal tourism innovations in Indonesia at the planning? Currently, there is a National Medium Term Planning 2020-2024 (Presidential Regulation No.18/2020) which explains the Ministry of Tourism, Ministry of Public Works, Regional Governments, State-Owned Enterprises, and Private Companies implementing large projects in the tourism sector for priority tourism destinations; and there is also a Regulation of the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy/Head of the Tourism and Creative Economy Agency Number 11 of 2022 concerning the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy/ Tourism and Creative Economy Agency for 2020-2024. However, no direction focuses on halal tourism. A regulation still exists concerning halal tourism namely DSN-MUI Fatwa No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016. When compared with other Asian countries, government support for the implementation of halal tourism in Asian countries is more optimal than in Indonesia (Wajdi, Ramadani, and Lubis 2023, 5495). Then, by using this fatwa we arranged content on halal tourism based on the DSN-MUI Fatwa can be divided into two factors, namely: Innovation, and Sharia Principles, as follows (Table 1).

Table 1. DSN-MUI Fatwa No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 on Guidelines for Tourism based on Sharia principles

Innovation	Sharia Principles
1. Halal Tourism Destination	Have religious facilities and halal-certified food and beverages; avoid polytheism, superstition, immorality, adultery, pornography, alcohol, drugs, and gambling.
2. Halal Tourism Travel Bureau	Organize Sharia tour packages; have a list of accommodations, tourist destinations, and food and beverage providers with halal certificates; and have a travel guide to prevent immorality, pornography, alcohol, drugs, and gambling
3. Halal Tourism Guide	Implement Sharia values in tasks; and certified professional standard competence.
4. Sharia Hotels	Have halal food and beverage certificates; Provide worship and purification facilities; and do not provide entertainment facilities for

polytheism, immorality, pornography, or immorality

Source: Processed Data by an author, 2023.

This table shows that there are two factors, namely: (1) innovation including (a) Halal Tourism Destination; (b) Halal Tourism Travel Bureau; (c) Halal Tourism Guide; and (d) Sharia Hotels; (2) Sharia principles as guidelines for tourism implementation.

Regional government issued regional government on halal tourism as a planning of halal tourism. There are eight regional regulations of halal tourism both provinces and regencies/cities in Indonesia: (1) Regional Regulation of West Nusa Tenggara Province No. 2/2016 on Halal Tourism; (2) Regional Regulation of West Sumatra Province No. 1/2020 on Halal Tourism; (3) Regional Regulation of Siak Regency No. 2/2017 on Halal Tourism; (4) Regional Regulation of Aceh Jaya Regency No. 10/2019 on Halal Tourism; (5) Regional Regulation of Muara Enim Regency No. 15/2019 on Halal Tourism; (6) Regional Regulation of Konawe Islands Regency No. 9/2019 on Halal Tourism; (7) Regional Regulation of Bandung Regency No. 6/2020 on Halal Tourism; and (8) Regional Regulation of Banjarmasin City No. 2/2021 on Halal Tourism. In this case, there are two provinces, five regencies, and one city that have innovated regional regulations for halal tourism. However, other regional governments are not yet to make innovations. Consequently, the halal tourism policies in the regional government have not been optimal. Therefore, the Ministry of Tourism must encourage other regional governments to innovate by arranging regional regulations for halal tourism. They can replicate an innovation through cooperation with regional governments that have made innovations in regulations.

This finding shows innovation in some regional regulations on halal tourism. This research complements previous research findings, that the impact of the DSN-MUI economic fatwa on laws, and government regulations can be identified (Mudzhar 2013). Thus, there is an innovation in regional regulations on halal tourism by regional governments (provinces and regencies/cities). This finding shows that there are innovations carried out by regional governments in halal tourism. In this case, the regional government has formulated an innovation that previously did not exist for developing potential halal tourism in the area.

The issuance of the DSN-MUI Fatwa No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 encourages regional governments to arrange innovation by issuing regional regulations for halal tourism at the planning stages, as follows (Table 2).

Table 2. Regional Regulation on Halal Tourism in Indonesia: Planning Stages

Regional Government	Regional regulation			Title of Regulations
	Provinces	Regencies	Cities	
A. Provinces:				
1. Nusa Tenggara Barat	1			Halal Tourism
2. Sumatera Barat	1			Halal Tourism
B. Regencies:				
1. Siak, Riau		1		Halal Tourism
2. Aceh Jaya, Aceh		1		Halal Tourism
3. Muara Enim, Sumatera Selatan		1		Halal Tourism
4. Konawe Kepulauan, Sulawesi Tenggara		1		Halal Tourism
5. Bandung, Jawa Barat		1		Halal Tourism
C. Cities:				
1. Banjarmasin. Kalimantan Selatan			1	Halal Tourism
Total	2	5	1	

Source: Processed Data by author, 2023.

The Implementation of Halal Tourism Innovations

What are the halal tourism innovations at the implementation stage? Regional governments must encourage the development of halal tourism through innovation in the implementation. They must update the existing halal tourism to become innovative, including changes in (1) tourism destinations; (2) tourism travel bureaus; (3) tourism guides; and (4) Sharia hotels as follows (Table 3)

Table 3. The Development of Halal Tourism Innovations: Implementation stages

Regional Government	Innovations Type			
	Halal Tourism Destination	Halal Tourism Travel Bureau	Halal Tourism Guide	Sharia Hotel
A. Province				
1. Nusa Tenggara Barat	1	1	1	1
2. Sumatera Barat	1	1	1	1
B. Regency				
1. Siak, Riau	1	1	1	1
2. Aceh Jaya, Aceh	1	1	1	1
3. Muara Enim, Sumatera Selatan	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
4. Konawe Kepulauan, Sulawesi Tenggara	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
5. Bandung, Jawa Barat	1	1	1	1
C. City				
1. Banjarmasin, Kalimantan Selatan	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Source: Sofyan et al., 2020 (Processed by the authors).

Notes: 0 = not available, not applicable, or not assessed (n/a); and 1 = available.

This table shows the results explaining that regional governments devise regulations for halal tourism at the implementation. During this stage, there are innovation-type namely halal tourism destinations; halal tourism travel bureaus; halal tourism guides; and Sharia hotels. There are two provinces and three regencies that have implemented stakeholder innovations for halal tourism. While, in two regencies and one city, stakeholder innovations for halal tourism are unknown because no reports are available on their websites. If they have not done so, they can replicate stakeholder innovation by cooperating with regional governments that have made such innovations. The results of this study strengthen the findings that proposed tourism innovation through implementation (Rodríguez, Williams, and Hall 2014). Then, the importance of developing tourism based on customer satisfaction between environmental destination brand perceptions and behavioral intentions (Ratnasari, Gunawan, Septiarini, Rusmita, and Kirana 2020).

In this case, the implementation of halal tourism requires a different approach to accommodate various communities with different norms and customs (Purwandani and Yusuf 2021). Meanwhile, the government and the Sharia financial industry need to support in formulation halal tourism model in the regions based on Islamic principles, national legal foundations, and regional regulations; and address halal certification issues in hospitality and event services; as well as object, marketing, industrial and institutional development to encourage economic growth (Yusuf, Djakfar, Isnaliana, and Maulana 2021). Furthermore, Islamic cultural events can be used as a tourist agenda by involving mosque institutions in the tourism business (Kadri 2022, 333).

Thus, the development of halal tourism through innovation at implementation includes (1) halal tourism destinations; (2) halal tourism in a travel bureau; (3) halal tourism guide, and (4) Sharia hotels. In this case, the regional government applies halal tourism through innovation at the implementation, including four innovations as mentioned. In other words, regional governments implement four innovations from previously non-existent to exist for developing regional incomes. Regional governments were implementing halal tourism through innovation however their numbers were still minimal. Therefore, the Ministry of Tourism must encourage regional governments to ensure the development of halal tourism through innovation.

The Evaluation of Halal Tourism Innovations

Final research question, what are the halal tourism innovations at the evaluation stage? After regional governments plan and implement halal tourism innovation, they conduct the development of halal tourism through innovation at the evaluation stage. Regional governments can evaluate halal tourism through innovation including assessments of destinations; travel agencies; guides; and sharia hotels to find out their performance. the evaluation of halal tourism through innovations based on the assessment scores of halal tourism innovations including halal tourism destinations; halal tourism travel agencies; halal tourism guides; and sharia hotels, are presented below (Table 5).

Table 4. The Evaluation of Halal Tourism Innovation based on the assessment scores

Regional Government	Innovations Type			
	Halal Tourism Destination	Halal Tourism Travel Bureau	Halal Tourism Guide	Sharia Hotel
A. Province				
1. Nusa Tenggara Barat	4.81	5	1	1
2. Sumatera Barat	4.24	5	5	4
B. Regency				
1. Siak, Riau		1	5	5
2. Aceh Jaya, Aceh		4	5	5
	3.35			
3. Muara Enim, Sumatera Selatan	4.47	n/a	n/a	n/a
4. Konawe Kepulauan, Sulawesi Tenggara	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
5. Bandung, Jawa Barat	n/a	3	5	5
C. City	4.06			
1. Banjarmasin, Kalimantan Selatan		n/a	n/a	n/a

Source: Sofyan et al., 2020 (Processed by the authors).

Notes: Scoring 1-5 = not good-very good. Column (2) = average assessment score; and Column (3) = Muslim visitor guide.

This table shows the Province of Nusa Tenggara Barat has the best average assessment score (4.81 = very good). Because this province has implemented regional regulations for halal tourism since 2016. We failed to obtain assessment scores in three other areas, namely (1) the Regency of Muara Enim; (2) the Regency of Konawe Kepulauan; and (3) the City of Banjarmasin. Because no reports are available on their websites. In this case, they can replicate these innovations to conduct assessments by collaborating with regions that have conducted halal tourism assessments and reported the results at the evaluation stage.

It was found that the development of halal tourism through innovations in Indonesia at evaluation stages is carried out on the application of innovations, namely: (1) halal tourist destinations; (2) halal tourism at travel agents; (3) halal tourist guides, and (4) sharia

hotels. The regional government applies an evaluation of halal tourism innovations, regarding the four innovations as mentioned through scoring. In other words, the regional government evaluates based on the scoring of four innovations from previously non-existent to existing as input for improving halal tourism in the future. Feedback from this evaluation is important to the regional government and can be carried out through the assessment score which includes the four innovations as mentioned. Because innovation is the determinant factor of the developing tourism industry (Sedarmayanti, Sastrayuda, and Afriza 2018, 88). Therefore, the Ministry of Tourism must encourage regional governments at the evaluation stage.

based on this result and discussion on data collected from sampling, then it is known, that the development of halal tourism through innovation in Indonesia has already existed and has a positive impact on both the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages. In this case, the strategy for developing halal tourism is expected to contribute to the direction and build community participation in developing halal tourism (Irwansyah, Dewi, Halisa, and Rifani 2023). As a result, halal tourism can be a leading sector that provides economic income for development.

CONCLUSION

The development of halal tourism through innovation, including regional regulation of halal tourism in both provinces and regencies/cities was still minimal quantitatively, even though it has experienced positive gradual growth in the planning of halal tourism innovations; the development of halal tourism in regional government both in provinces and regencies/cities, through innovations namely halal tourism destinations, halal travel bureaus, halal guides; and Sharia hotels at the implementation of halal tourism innovations; and innovation in regional government is carried out through the assessment score indicator innovations includes halal tourism destinations, halal travel bureau; guides; and halal Sharia hotels at the evaluation of halal tourism innovations stage. Research limitation is used library research for collecting secondary data without primary data.

Suggestions for future research to complement the results of this research on the development of halal tourism through innovation at the regional government level, it is recommended that future researchers investigate halal tourism innovation at the central government level.

REFERENCES

- Abadi, Priyadi. 2016. *Muslim Traveller Solutions 16-17*. Jakarta: AMP Press.
- Aldebert, Bénédicte, Rani J. Dang, and Christian Longhi. 2011. "Innovation in the tourism industry: The case of tourism." *Tourism Management* 32(5): 1204–1213, available at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2010.08.010>.
- Danim, Sudarwan. 2000. *Pengantar Studi Penelitian Kebijakan 173-174*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- DSN-MUI. 2024. Fatwa DSN-MUI No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Pariwisata Berdasarkan Prinsip Syari'ah, available at <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0BxTI-INihFyzV0dPcEdtd0kwn2M/view?resourcekey=0-ZW0VKJGV2YqoVoRC4kuszg>
- El-Gohary, Hatem. 2016. "Halal tourism, is it really Halal?" *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 19(B): 124–130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.013>
- GMTI-Global Muslim Travel Index. 2021. available at <https://www.crescentrating.com/reports/global-muslim-travel-index-2021.html>.
- Irwansyah, Irwansyah, Mayasari Dewi, Novia Nour Halisa, and Ahmad Rifani. 2023. "Development Strategies of Halal Tourism Post-covid-19 Using the Soar Method on the Riverbanks of Banjarmasin City." *Kurdish Studies* 11(2): 5649-5660, available at <https://kurdishstudies.net/menu-script/index.php/KS/article/view/1137>

- Kadri. 2022. "Religion on Tourism: Promoting Inclusive Islam in Lombok Island, Indonesia." *Studia Islamika* 29(2), available at <https://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/14471/11143>
- Kayaci, Müslüm. 2022. "Perceptions of citizens for public institutions' performance in crises: Covid-19 crisis in Turkey context," *Balkan Social Science Review* 19: 185–205, available at <https://doi.org/10.46763/BSSR2219185k>
- Lutfiyah. 2017. "Religious tourism in the perspective of Kendal Society." *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies*, 5(1): 26, available at <https://journal.iainkudus.ac.id/index.php/QIJS/article/view/3755/pdf>
- Marlinda, Ajeng Puspa, Bambang Cipto, Faris Al-Fadhat, and Hasse Jubba. 2021. "South Korea's Halal Tourism Policy - The Primacy of Demographic Changes and Regional Diplomacy." *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies* 10(3): 253-253. doi:10.36941/ajis-2021-0081.
- Melugbo, Doris Ujunwa, Onwuka, Ifunanya Amara. 2020. "Demographic variations in public views of response to and management of the Covid-19 pandemic." *Balkan Social Science Review* 16: 279–297, available at <https://doi.org/10.46763/BSSR2016279um>
- Mudzhar, M. Atho. 2013. "The Legal Reasoning and Socio-Legal Impact of the Fatwās of the Council of Indonesian Ulama on Economic Issues." *AHKAM: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah* 13(1). doi:10.15408/ajis.v13i1.946.
- Mustopadidjaja, A.R. 1993. *Study Kebijaksanaan Pengembangan dan Penerapan dalam rangka Administrasi dan Manajemen Pembangunan*, Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia.
- Papastathopoulos, Avraam, Kostas Kaminakis, and Charilaos Mertzanis. 2020. "What Services Do Muslim Tourists Want? Uncovering Nonlinear Relationships and Unobserved Heterogeneity." *Tourism Management Perspectives* 35. 100720. doi:10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100720.
- Purwandani, Intan, and Mohamad Yusuf. 2021. "Localizing Indonesian Halal Tourism Policy within Local Customs, *Qanun*, and Marketing." *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*: 1–19. doi:10.1080/19407963.2021.1996382.
- Ratnasari, Ririn Tri, Sri Gunawan, Dina Fitriana Septiarini, Sylva Alif Rusmita, and Kusuma Candra Kirana. 2020. "Customer satisfaction between perceptions of environment destination brand and behavioural intention." *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 10(12): 472-487, available at https://www.ijicc.net/images/vol10iss12/101236_Ratnasari_2020_E_R.pdf
- Rodríguez, Isabel, Allan M. Williams, and C. Michael Hall. 2014. "Tourism innovation policy: Implementation and outcomes," *Annals of Tourism Research* 49: 76–93. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2014.08.004>.
- Samori, Zakiah, Nor Zafir Md Salleh, and Mohammad Mahyuddin Khalid. 2016. "Current trends on halal tourism: Cases on selected Asian countries", *Tourism Management Perspectives* 19(B): 131–136, available at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.011>
- Sedarmayanti, Gumelar S. Sastrayuda, and Lia Afriza. *Pembangunan dan Pengembangan Pariwisata*. Bandung, PT Refika Aditama, 2018.
- Slamet, Irwan Abdullah, and Nur Quma Laila. 2022. "The contestation of the meaning of halal tourism," *Heliyon*, 8 (3), available at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e09098>.
- Sofyan, Riyanto. 2020. *Laporan Perkembangan Pariwisata Ramah Muslim Daerah 2019-2020* 19-53. Jakarta: KNEKS (Komite Nasional Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah), available at kneks-2020-laporan-perkembangan-pariwisata-ramah-muslim-daerah-2019-2020.pdf (shariaknowledgecentre.id).
- Sugiyono. 2003. *Statistika untuk Penelitian* 62-67, Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Utomo, Tri Widodo Wahyu. 2017. *Inovasi Harga Mati: Sebuah Pengantar Inovasi Administrasi Negara*, Jakarta: PT Rajagrafindo Persada.

- Wajdi, Farid, Rahmat Ramadhani, and Ikhsan Lubis. 2023. "Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia and Comparisons in Several Asian Countries". *Kurdish Studies* 11(2): 5495-5505, available at <https://doi.org/10.58262/ks.v11i2.398>
- Wiryanto, Wisber. 2017. The Study of Human Resources Competency Development Policy in the Tourism Sector of Bureaucracy Reformation Era. In Abadi, Toto Wahyu, Poppy Febriana, Ilmi Usrotin Choiriyah, Lailul Mursyidah, Nur Maghfirah Aesthetika (Eds.). *City Branding & Tourism Policy Based On Cultural Wisdom in Indonesia* 156-164, available at <http://eprints.umsida.ac.id/8662/1/Proceedings%20Synergy%20of%20Government%20and%20Private%20in%20Strategic%20Planning%20of%20Tourism%20Region%20Development.pdf>
- . 2020a. Population administration service innovation in Indonesia during the Covid-19 pandemic. In Bevaola Kusumasari (Ed.). *Iapa Proceedings: Conference: Strengthening Governance Capacity and Public Administration Amidst Pandemic and New Normal Era* 512-523, Yogyakarta: Indonesian Association for Public Administration, available at <https://doi.org/10.30589/proceedings.2020.425>
- . 2020b. "Initiative and Implementation of the Public Service Innovation by the Regional Government in Indonesia." *Journal of Governance and Local Politics* 2(2): 201-215, available at <https://doi.org/10.47650/jglp.v2i2.134>
- Yağmur, Yenal, and Akin Aksu. 2020. "Destination Image of Antalya from the Perspectives of Tourists Staying in Hospitality Establishments with the Concept of Halal Tourism." *Journal of Tourism and Services* 11(21): 103-128. doi:10.29036/Jots.V11i21.168.
- Yusuf, Muhammad Yasir, Inayatillah Djakfar, Isnaliana, and Hafizh Maulana. 2021. "Halal Tourism to Promote Community's Economic Growth: A Model for Aceh, Indonesia." *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 29(4): 2869–2891. doi:10.47836/pjssh.29.4.42.